

PLANNING AND TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

Tuesday, 2 May 2017

Minutes of the meeting of the Planning and Transportation Committee held at the Guildhall EC2 at 10.00 am

Present

Members:

Christopher Hayward (Chairman)	Alderman Gregory Jones QC
Deputy Alastair Moss (Deputy Chairman)	Alderman Vincent Keaveny
Randall Anderson	Oliver Lodge
Alderman Sir Michael Bear	Andrew Mayer
Mark Boleat	Deputy Brian Mooney
Mark Bostock	Sylvia Moys
Deputy Keith Bottomley	Barbara Newman
Henry Colthurst	Graham Packham
Peter Dunphy	Susan Pearson
Emma Edhem	Deputy Henry Pollard
Marianne Fredericks	Jason Pritchard
Graeme Harrower	Oliver Sells QC
Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark	

Officers:

Simon Murrells	- Assistant Town Clerk
Amanda Thompson	- Town Clerk's Department
Sabina Johal	- Town Clerk's Department
Deborah Cluett	- Comptollers and City Solicitor
Clive Cornwell	- Department of the Built Environment
Carolyn Dwyer	- Director of Built Environment
Annie Hampson	- Department of the Built Environment
Ian Hughes	- Department of the Built Environment
Steve Presland	- Transportation & Public Realm Director
Gwyn Richards	- Department of the Built Environment
Peter Young	- City Surveyor's Department

1. APOLOGIES

Apologies for absence were received from Rehana Ameer, Alderman Robert Howard, Judith Pleasance, James de Sausmarez and Deputy James Thomson.

2. MEMBERS' DECLARATIONS UNDER THE CODE OF CONDUCT IN RESPECT OF ITEMS ON THE AGENDA

Alderman Vincent Keaveny and Deputy Alastair Moss declared personal interests in agenda item 10c) – Bernard Morgan House.

Alderman Keaveny advised that he would remain in the meeting but take no part in the discussion or voting, Deputy Moss advised that he would leave the meeting during consideration of the item.

Susan Pearson declared a personal interest in the same item by virtue of living on the Golden Lane Estate and having previously objected to the application. She advised that she would remain in the meeting but take no part in the discussion or voting.

3. APPOINTMENT OF COMMITTEE

The Order of the Court of Common Council, appointing the Committee and approving its Terms of Reference was received.

4. ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN

The Committee proceeded to elect a Chairman pursuant to Standing Order No. 29. A list of Members eligible to stand was read and Christopher Hayward declared his willingness to serve.

With Christopher Hayward being the only member indicating his willingness to do so, the Committee;

RESOLVED – That Christopher Hayward be elected Chairman in accordance with Standing Order 29 for the year ensuing.

On being elected, the Chairman thanked the Committee for its support.

The Chairman welcomed new Members Alderman Sir Michael Bear, Alderman Gregory Jones, Rahana Ameer, Mark Boleat, Mark Bostock, Deputy Keith Bottomley, Christopher Hill, Deputy Jamie Ingham Clark, Andrew Mayer, Barbara Newman, Susan Pearson, Jason Pritchard, Oliver Sells and William Upton.

5. ELECTION OF DEPUTY CHAIRMAN

The Committee proceeded to elect a Deputy Chairman pursuant to Standing Order No. 30. A list of Members eligible to stand was read and Alastair Moss declared his willingness to serve.

With Alastair Moss being the only member indicating his willingness to do so, the Committee;

RESOLVED – That Alastair Moss be elected Deputy Chairman in accordance with Standing Order 30 for the year ensuing.

On being elected the Deputy Chairman thanked the Committee.

6. **APPOINTMENT OF SUB-COMMITTEES AND WORKING PARTIES**

The Committee considered a report of the Town Clerk relative to the appointment of Sub Committees for the ensuring year (2017/2018).

A Member commented that the report before the Committee should also include Member's individual attendance figures for the previous year in order to assist Members make appointments to the Sub-Committees.

The Chairman asked Members if they were in support of this but the majority were opposed.

RESOLVED – That,

- a) the Streets and Walkways Sub Committee Terms of Reference be approved;
- b) the following memberships be agreed:-

Streets and Walkways Sub Committee

Chairman of the Grand Committee – Chris Hayward

Deputy Chairman of the Grand Committee – Deputy Alistair Moss

Randall Anderson

Emma Edhem

Marianne Fredericks

Alderman Gregory Jones

Paul Martinelli

Graham Packham

Oliver Sells

Together with three ex-officio Members representing the Finance, Police and Open Spaces & City Gardens Committees.

Local Plans Sub Committee and Local Plan Working Party

Chairman of the Grand Committee – Chris Hayward

Deputy Chairman of the Grand Committee – Deputy Alistair Moss

Randall Anderson

Marianne Fredericks

Alderman Gregory Jones

Paul Martinelli

Susan Pearson

Together with an ex-officio Member representing the Policy and Resources Committee.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted

7. **MINUTES**

RESOLVED - That the minutes of the meeting held on 21 March 2017 be agreed as a correct record.

8. QUESTIONS ON MATTERS RELATING TO THE WORK OF THE COMMITTEE

Question from Mark Boleat

Will the Chairman explain the rationale for Committee papers that run to over 800 pages in length including over 450 pages on a single item, most of which are repetitive. More specifically will the Chairman explain why it is considered necessary to circulate early single communication about a particular application to the Committee, and will he tell the Committee whether this practice is followed by other London councils?

Response

This application has attracted a substantial amount of comments which is why the papers are so long. It is almost inevitable that these will repeat similar objections and grounds for support. A table in the report summarises the points made and where in the report the matter is dealt with.

Planning Authorities across London adopt a variety of approaches.

The Chairman sought the views of Members as to whether or not they would wish to access public comments in a different way and not to have them attached to the report and it was agreed that officers should report back to the Committee with some alternative options and information on the approaches adopted elsewhere.

Question from Marianne Fredericks

The viability reports are crucial - why were these not sent to Members?

Response

Members were given the opportunity to view them before the meeting, they couldn't be circulated as part of the agenda as some of the information was commercially sensitive and not available to the public.

9. DELEGATED DECISIONS OF THE CHIEF PLANNING OFFICER AND DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director in respect of development and advertisement applications dealt with under delegated authority.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted.

10. VALID APPLICATIONS LIST FOR COMMITTEE

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer and Development Director which provided details of valid planning applications received by the department since the last meeting.

RESOLVED – That the report be noted

11. REPORTS RELATIVE TO PLANNING APPLICATIONS

11.1 Creed Court 3 - 5 Ludgate Hill, 1 - 3 Creed Lane And 11 - 12 Ludgate Square, London EC4M 7AA

The Committee received a report of the Chief Planning Officer (CPO) in respect of the redevelopment of the site behind the retained facade of 3 - 5 Ludgate Hill to provide a part five, part seven storey building with three basement levels for use as a 132 bedroom hotel (ClassC1) with Class A3 retail at part lower ground floors and part ground floor, with associated plant at basement and sixth floor level (total floor space 7,660sq.m GIA).

The CPO reported that 50 objections had been received across three public consultations from 28 residents and their representatives regarding the proposed development. The objections related to the loss of office accommodation and local retail uses, the proposed hotel use, the impact on the St. Paul's Cathedral Conservation Area, the capacity of the surrounding streets for the vehicles and pedestrians associated with the development and the potential impact of the development on residential amenity including loss of daylight and sunlight, loss of privacy from overlooking, impact on air quality and increased noise from construction works, and the operation of the hotel and its associated plant.

The CPO advised that the proposed development would result in the loss of 3,381sq.m (GIA) of office floor space. Office viability information had been provided in support of the application, which demonstrated that continued office use would not be a viable option on this site. This information had been independently verified by consultants on behalf of the City Corporation.

The Committee noted that the principle of hotel use on the site was in accordance with Local Plan policies, and the proposed servicing arrangements were considered to be acceptable. There was considered to be sufficient capacity in the surrounding streets for the vehicles and pedestrians associated with the development. The building had been designed to sufficiently minimise the potential impact on the amenities of nearby residential occupiers in relation to privacy, overlooking, noise, daylight and sunlight.

An independent review of the applicant's daylight and sunlight assessment had been undertaken by an external consultant on behalf of the City Corporation and demonstrated that the majority of windows and rooms in neighbouring properties would not experience noticeable reductions in daylight and sunlight. Whilst there would be some impacts on daylight and sunlight as a result of the development, the majority would be minor in nature and were considered to be acceptable given the densely developed urban nature of the site.

The proposed development was considered to comply with the Development

Plan as a whole and to be appropriate subject to conditions, CIL payments and a Section 106 agreement being entered into to cover matters set out in the report.

Mr Harman Sond, Mr Matthew Rimmer, Sir Brian Langstaff, Deputy Richard Regan and Ann Holmes spoke in objection to the application which they considered would have a detrimental impact in relation to loss of daylight/sunlight, change of use impact and residential amenity impact. Concern was also expressed in relation to the loss of office space and the effects of the demolition and rebuilding process.

Mr Richard Ward, Mr Gordon Ingram and Mr Stephan Reinke were heard on behalf of the applicant Dominvs Group

Several Members spoke in support of the objectors and expressed concern in relation to the relevance of the viability statement, the loss of office space and the impact the development of a seven story hotel building would have on the adjacent residential building at Lambert Court.

Other Members spoke in support of the hotel development which they considered was appropriate for the area, especially as redevelopment of office space in the existing building wasn't viable.

Arising from the discussion, the application was put to the vote, the result of which was as follows:

14 votes in favour of the CPO recommendation
10 votes against

RESOLVED – That Planning permission be granted for the above proposal in accordance with details set out in the proposed schedule, subject to:

(i) Planning obligations being entered into as set out in the body of the report, the decision not being issued until such obligations have been executed:

(ii) That officers be instructed to negotiate and execute obligations in respect of those matters set out in "Planning Obligations" under Section 106 of the Town & Country Planning Act 1990.

During consideration of this item, and in respect of Standing Order No. 40, the Chairman sought the Committee's consent to extend the meeting to allow the item to be considered. He further advised that due to time constraints, and in order to consider the item fully, it would be necessary to defer all remaining agenda items to a future meeting. This was put to the meeting and AGREED.

11.2 Barbican and Golden Lane Estates: Proposed Conservation Area

Deferred.

11.3 Bernard Morgan House 43 Golden Lane London EC1Y 0RS

Deferred.

11.4 Enforcement Policy SPD Report

Deferred.

12. REPORTS OF THE DIRECTOR OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT

12.1 Thames Court Footbridge

Deferred.

12.2 Electric Vehicle Charging Update

Deferred.

**13. DECISIONS TAKEN UNDER DELEGATED AUTHORITY OR URGENCY
SINCE THE LAST MEETING OF THE COMMITTEE**

Deferred.

14. APPOINTMENT OF SUB-COMMITTEE CHAIRMEN

Deferred.

The meeting closed at 1.00 pm

Chairman

**Contact Officer: Amanda Thompson
tel. no.: 020 7332 3414
amanda.thompson@cityoflondon.gov.uk**